

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
AT TACOMA

NATHEN BARTON,

Plaintiff,

v.

WALMART INC.,

Defendant.

CASE NO. 3:23-cv-05063-DGE

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this agreement is consistent with LCR 26(c). It does not confer blanket protection on all disclosures or responses to discovery, the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential or highly confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles, and it does not presumptively entitle parties to file confidential or highly confidential information under seal.

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER  
Case No. 3:23-CV-05063-DGE

**Williams, Kastner & Gibbs PLLC**  
601 Union Street, Suite 4100  
Seattle, WA 98101-2380  
(206) 628-6600

2. PROTECTED MATERIAL

Protected Material shall include Confidential Material and Highly Confidential Material. Confidential Material shall include but not be limited to the following documents and tangible things produced or otherwise exchanged: customer communication and order records, research, design, development, financial, technical, marketing, planning, personal, or commercial information, as such terms are used in the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure (Fed. R. Civ.) and any applicable case law interpreting Fed. R. Civ. 26(c)(1)(G); contracts; non-public compilations of retail prices; proprietary information; vendor agreements; personnel files; claim/litigation information; and nonpublic policies and procedures.

Highly Confidential Material shall include but not be limited to the following documents and tangible things produced or otherwise exchanged: trade secrets, nonpublic research and development data, including, but not be limited to, cost data, pricing formulas, inventory management programs, and other sales or business information not known to the public; and information obtained from a non-party pursuant to a non-disclosure agreement. Highly Confidential Material shall also refer to any information that a party believes in good faith to be subject to federal, state or foreign data protection laws or other privacy obligations.

3. SCOPE

The protections conferred by this agreement cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of confidential material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by parties or their counsel that might reveal confidential material. However, the protections conferred by this agreement do not cover information that is in the public domain or becomes part of the public domain through trial or otherwise.

4. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

4.1 Basic Principles. A receiving party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another party or by a non-party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

Case No: 3:23-CV-05063-DGE

defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this agreement. Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a receiving party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this agreement.

4.2 Disclosure of Protected Material. Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the designating party, a receiving party may disclose any Protected Material only to:

(a) the receiving party's counsel of record in this action, as well as employees of counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation;

(b) the officers, directors, and employees (including in-house counsel) of the receiving party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation, unless the parties agree that a particular document or material produced is Highly Confidential and is so designated;

(c) experts and consultants to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

(d) the court, court personnel, and court reporters and their staff;

(e) copy or imaging services retained by counsel to assist in the duplication of Protected Material, provided that counsel for the party retaining the copy or imaging service instructs the service not to disclose any confidential material to third parties and to immediately return all originals and copies of any confidential material;

(f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the designating party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this agreement;

(g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a

1 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

2       4.3     Filing Protected Material. Before filing Protected Material or discussing or  
3 referencing such material in court filings, the filing party shall confer with the designating party,  
4 in accordance with Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(A), to determine whether the designating party will  
5 remove the confidentiality designation, whether the document can be redacted, or whether a  
6 motion to seal or stipulation and proposed order is warranted. During the meet and confer process,  
7 the designating party must identify the basis for sealing the specific confidential information at  
8 issue, and the filing party shall include this basis in its motion to seal, along with any objection to  
9 sealing the information at issue. Local Civil Rule 5(g) sets forth the procedures that must be  
10 followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to  
11 file material under seal. A party who seeks to maintain the confidentiality of its information must  
12 satisfy the requirements of Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(B), even if it is not the party filing the motion  
13 to seal. Failure to satisfy this requirement will result in the motion to seal being denied, in  
14 accordance with the strong presumption of public access to the Court's files.

15     5.       DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

16       5.1     Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each party  
17 or non-party that designates information or items for protection under this agreement must take  
18 care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate  
19 standards. The designating party must designate for protection only those parts of material,  
20 documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify, so that other portions of the  
21 material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept  
22 unjustifiably within the ambit of this agreement.

23       Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are  
24 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to  
25 unnecessarily encumber or delay the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses  
26 and burdens on other parties) expose the designating party to sanctions.

1 If it comes to a designating party's attention that information or items that it designated for  
 2 protection do not qualify for protection, the designating party must promptly notify all other parties  
 3 that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

4 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this  
 5 agreement (see, *e.g.*, second paragraph of section 5.2(b) below), or as otherwise stipulated or  
 6 ordered, disclosure or discovery material that qualifies for protection under this agreement must  
 7 be clearly so designated before or when the material is disclosed or produced.

8 (a) Information in documentary form: (*e.g.*, paper or electronic documents,  
 9 discovery responses, and deposition exhibits, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other  
 10 pretrial or trial proceedings), the designating party must affix the word "CONFIDENTIAL" or  
 11 "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains Protected Material.

12 (b) Testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial proceedings: the parties  
 13 and any participating non-parties must identify on the record, during the deposition or other pretrial  
 14 proceeding, all protected testimony, without prejudice to their right to so designate other testimony  
 15 after reviewing the transcript. Any party or non-party may, within thirty (30) days after receiving  
 16 the transcript of the deposition or other pretrial proceeding, designate portions of the transcript, or  
 17 exhibits thereto, as Confidential or Highly Confidential Material. If a party or non-party desires to  
 18 protect confidential information at trial, the issue should be addressed during the pre-trial  
 19 conference.

20 (c) Other tangible items: the producing party must affix in a prominent place  
 21 on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the word  
 22 "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the  
 23 information or item warrant protection, the producing party, to the extent practicable, shall identify  
 24 the protected portion(s).

25 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to  
 26 designate qualified information or items as Protected Material does not, standing alone, waive the

designating party's right to secure protection under this agreement for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the receiving party must make reasonable efforts to ensure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this agreement.

## 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any party or non-party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a designating party's confidentiality designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a party does not waive its right to challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the original designation is disclosed.

6.2 Meet and Confer. The parties must make every attempt to resolve any dispute regarding confidential designations without court involvement. Any motion regarding confidential designations or for a protective order must include a certification, in the motion or in a declaration or affidavit, that the movant has engaged in a good faith meet and confer conference with other affected parties in an effort to resolve the dispute without court action. The certification must list the date, manner, and participants to the conference. A good faith effort to confer requires a face-to-face meeting or a telephone conference.

6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the parties cannot resolve a challenge without court intervention, the designating party may file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under Local Civil Rule 7 (and in compliance with Local Civil Rule 5(g), if applicable). The burden of persuasion in any such motion shall be on the designating party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the challenging party to sanctions. All parties shall continue to maintain the material in question as confidential until the court rules on the challenge.

## 7. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER  
Case No: 3:23-CV-05063-DGE

1 If a party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels  
 2 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that party  
 3 must:

4 (a) promptly notify the designating party in writing and include a copy of the  
 5 subpoena or court order;

6 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to  
 7 issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is  
 8 subject to this agreement. Such notification shall include a copy of this agreement; and

9 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by  
 10 the designating party whose confidential material may be affected.

11 8. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

12 If a receiving party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected  
 13 Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this agreement, the receiving  
 14 party must immediately (a) notify in writing the designating party of the unauthorized disclosures,  
 15 (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the protected material, (c) inform the  
 16 person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this agreement,  
 17 and (d) request that such person or persons execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be  
 18 Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

19 9. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED  
 20 MATERIAL

21 When a producing party gives notice to receiving parties that certain inadvertently  
 22 produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the  
 23 receiving parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision  
 24 is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order or  
 25 agreement that provides for production without prior privilege review. The parties agree to the  
 26 entry of a non-waiver order under Fed. R. Evid. 502(d) as set forth herein.

10. NON-TERMINATION AND RETURN OF DOCUMENTS

Within 60 days after the termination of this action, including all appeals, each receiving party must return all confidential material to the producing party, including all copies, extracts and summaries thereof. Alternatively, the parties may agree upon appropriate methods of destruction.

Notwithstanding this provision, counsel are entitled to retain one archival copy of all documents filed with the court, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain confidential material.

The confidentiality obligations imposed by this agreement shall remain in effect until a designating party agrees otherwise in writing or a court orders otherwise.



1 IT IS SO STIPULATED.

2 /s/ Nathen Barton

3 Nathen Barton  
4 4618 NW 11th Ct.  
5 Camas, WA 98607

6 *Plaintiff (pro se)*

/s/ Eddy Silverman

WILLIAMS KASTNER  
Rodney L. Umberger (WSBA #24948)  
rumberger@williamskastner.com  
Eddy Silverman (WSBA #53494)  
esilverman@williamskastner.com  
601 Union Street  
Seattle, WA 98101  
Telephone: (206) 628-6600  
Facsimile: (206) 628-6611

/s/ Sean G. Wieber

WINSTON & STRAWN LLP  
Sean G. Wieber (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
swieber@winston.com  
Kevin Simpson (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
kpsimpson@winston.com  
35 W. Wacker Drive  
Chicago, IL 60601-9703  
Telephone: (312) 558-5600  
Facsimile: (312) 558-5700

*Counsel for Defendant Walmart Inc.*

1 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED

2 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that pursuant to Fed. R. Evid. 502(d), the production of any  
3 documents, electronically stored information (ESI) or information, whether inadvertent or  
4 otherwise, in this proceeding shall not, for the purposes of this proceeding or any other federal or  
5 state proceeding, constitute a waiver by the producing party of any privilege applicable to those  
6 documents, including the attorney-client privilege, attorney work-product protection, or any other  
7 privilege or protection recognized by law. This Order shall be interpreted to provide the maximum  
8 protection allowed by Fed. R. Evid. 502(d). The provisions of Fed. R. Evid. 502(b) do not apply.  
9 Nothing contained herein is intended to or shall serve to limit a party's right to conduct a review  
10 of documents, ESI or information (including metadata) for relevance, responsiveness and/or  
11 segregation of privileged and/or protected information before production. Information produced  
12 in discovery that is protected as privileged or work product shall be immediately returned to the  
13 producing party.

14  
15 DATED: June 6, 2023.


16  
17  
18   
19 \_\_\_\_\_  
20 David G. Estudillo  
21 United States District Judge  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26

EXHIBIT AACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name], of  
 \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of  
 perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was  
 issued by the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington on \_\_\_\_\_  
 [date] in the case of *Barton v. Walmart Inc.*, 3:23-cv-05063-DGE. I agree to comply with and to  
 be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge  
 that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt.  
 I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject  
 to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the  
 provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the  
 Western District of Washington for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective  
 Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

City and State where sworn and signed: \_\_\_\_\_

Printed name: \_\_\_\_\_

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_